

Web Appendix for Koremenos, Barbara (2011). The Continent of International Law. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, forthcoming.

1. Symmetry of Agreements
2. Summary Statistics of Variables for Factor Analysis
3. Regression Scoring Coefficients
4. Definition of Complexity and List of Agreements by Complexity

## 1. Symmetry of Agreements

**Symmetry of Agreements by Issue Area, percentage of agreements**

|                              | Economics<br>(%) | Environment<br>(%) | Human<br>Rights<br>(%) | Security<br>(%) | Total<br>(%) |
|------------------------------|------------------|--------------------|------------------------|-----------------|--------------|
| <i>Symmetric</i>             | 78               | 92                 | 100                    | 52              | 79           |
| <i>Mildly Asymmetric</i>     | 21               | 8                  | 0                      | 48              | 20           |
| <i>Profoundly Asymmetric</i> | 1                | 0                  | 0                      | 0               | 1            |
| N                            | 72               | 25                 | 24                     | 25              | 146          |

## 2. Summary Statistics of Variables used in Factor Analysis

**Summary Statistics**

|                                       | Obs. | Mean   | Std. Dev. | Min | Max |
|---------------------------------------|------|--------|-----------|-----|-----|
| <i>simplicity cooperation problem</i> | 144  | 2.3125 | 0.7142    | 1   | 3   |
| <i>length</i>                         | 144  | 5.7431 | 4.2274    | 1   | 22  |
| <i>annex/appendix</i>                 | 144  | 0.2153 | 0.4124    | 0   | 1   |
| <i>precision</i>                      | 144  | 3.0486 | 0.7128    | 1   | 4   |
| <i>references to other agreements</i> | 144  | 0.7639 | 0.4262    | 0   | 1   |

Notes: Simplicity is coded as (1) relatively complex, (2) average, (3) relatively simple. Precision is coded as (1) very vague, (2) somewhat vague, (3) somewhat precise, (4) very precise. See the text and web appendices for further discussion.

### 3. Regression Scoring Coefficients

| <b>Regression Scoring Coefficients</b> |         |         |         |         |
|--|---------|---------|---------|---------|
|  | Factor1 | Factor2 | Factor3 | Factor4 |
| <i>simplicity cooperation problem</i>  | 0.6474  | 0.0362  | 0.1160  | 0.1283  |
| <i>length</i>                          | -0.0668 | 0.4895  | 0.1557  | -0.1551 |
| <i>annex/appendix</i>                  | 0.0970  | 0.4303  | -0.1769 | 0.1566  |
| <i>precision</i>                       | 0.0797  | 0.0197  | 0.5030  | 0.0079  |
| <i>references to other agreements</i>  | -0.2718 | 0.0289  | 0.2299  | 0.3050  |

#### **4. Complexity Variable: Definition and List of Agreements**

Coding the complexity of international agreements is one of the novel aspects of the Continent of International Law (COIL). The coding allows for three degrees of complexity: relatively simple, average, and relatively complex. While being one of the most important concepts in this research project, the coding decisions are among the most subjective ones, and hence warrant some further elaboration.

Complexity for the purposes of COIL refers to the ease with which a set of cooperation problems can be resolved through international cooperation. This conception is, hence, distinct from complexity as the degree to which a subject matter can be grasped and understood by the involved actors. An international agreement is not complex because only subject experts are able to understand it; rather, an international agreement is complex when it addresses a cooperation problem that is hard to solve through international cooperation. As such, three factors are particularly important for assessing the complexity of an agreement: the number of involved actors, the nature and number of cooperation problems, and the sensitivity of the issue in question. These points are considered in more detail in turn.

The first factor is the number of actors involved. From a mere transaction cost argument, the more states are involved in an agreement, the more difficult it will be to reach consensus on its terms. But the number of actors involved comes into play also on another dimension: Not only are there the participating states, but also the actors within each participating state that need to be taken into account. Specifically, agreements characterized by “two-level problems,” in which a government lacks complete control over domestic actors such as firms or NGOs, will be coded as more complex than agreements without such two-level dynamics. Two-level problems are particularly acute in some of the environmental and human rights agreements.

A second factor to look at is the number and nature of the underlying cooperation problems. Encouraging positive externalities, for instance, is often relatively simple through the use of financial incentives. Agreements characterized by enforcement problems, distribution problems, or uncertainty about preferences, on the other hand, are coded as more complex. As an example, consider human rights agreements. These are often characterized by distribution problems (due to conflict about which human rights standard to choose), and uncertainty about the other signatories’ true intentions adds to the complexity of these agreements.

Third, the sensitivity of the agreement is considered. Security and disarmament agreements pertain to vital interests of states, and maintaining cooperation while another party to the agreement defects is particularly costly. These agreements are, moreover, often characterized by multiple cooperation problems and involve several actors, and therefore typically score high on the complexity variable. Trade and financial agreements, by contrast, are much less risky than disarmament agreements, typically involve only two cooperation problems, and as a consequence receive a lower coding for complexity in general.

Of the 146 agreements in the current release of COIL, 66 (or 45%) are coded as relatively simple. 57 (39%) are of average complexity, and the remaining 23 (16%) agreements are relatively complex. Table 1 shows the three categories of agreement complexity across issue areas. The table illustrates well the points just made. The share of relatively complex agreements is highest among security and human rights agreements, with 32% and 50%, respectively. The sample contains only two relatively complex economics agreement, and only one relatively complex environmental agreement.

**Table 1: Agreement Complexity across Issue Areas**

|                           | <i>Security</i> | <i>Economics</i> | <i>Environment</i> | <i>Human Rights</i> | <i>Total</i> |
|---------------------------|-----------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------------|
| <i>Relatively Simple</i>  | 13 (52%)        | 36 (50%)         | 11 (44%)           | 6 (25%)             | 66 (45%)     |
| <i>Average</i>            | 4 (16%)         | 34 (47%)         | 13 (52%)           | 6 (25%)             | 57 (39%)     |
| <i>Relatively Complex</i> | 8 (32%)         | 2 (3%)           | 1 (4%)             | 12 (50%)            | 23 (16%)     |
| <i>Total</i>              | 25 (100%)       | 72 (100%)        | 25 (100%)          | 24 (100%)           | 146 (100%)   |

The remainder of this document gives an overview of all agreements in the sample, sorted by degree of complexity; the COIL ID, the UNTS number, and the agreement name are given for each agreement.

| <b>ID</b>                | <b>UNTS</b> | <b>Name</b>   |
|--------------------------|-------------|---|
| <i>relatively simple</i> |             |   |
| AC 1                     | 14430       | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement concerning grain to be supplied by the Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain to the Government of Mali within the framework of the Cereals Food Aid Programme of the European Economic Community. |
| AC 10                    | 5579        | Agricultural Commodities Agreement under Title I of the Agricultural Trade Development and Assistance Act, as amended (with exchange of notes).   |
| AC 13                    | 17753       | Agreement relating to the transfer of agricultural commodities.   |
| AC 14                    | 4365        | Agricultural Commodities Agreement under Title I of the Agricultural Trade Development and Assistance Act (with agreed minute and memorandum of Understanding).   |
| AC 15                    | 15915       | Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities   |
| AC 2                     | 10249       | Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities.  |
| AC 23                    | 18143       | Agreement for the sale of agricultural commodities (with minutes of negotiations of 20 March 1978).   |
| AC 3                     | 13092       | Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities.  |
| AC 4                     | 12254       | Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities.  |
| AC 48                    | 3239        | Exchange of notes constituting an interim agreement relating to the purchase of surplus agricultural commodities.   |
| AC 5                     | 10135       | Supplementary Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities.  |
| AC 7                     | 11046       | Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities.  |
| AC 9                     | 13629       | Agreement for sales of agricultural commodities.  |
| DS 11                    | 17086       | Agreement on the prevention of accidental nuclear war.  |
| EN 1                     | 21678       | Agreement concerning financial co-operation—Refuse Disposal in the Freetown Metropolitan Area.  |
| EN 16                    | 9075        | Agreement concerning the protection of frontier forests against fire.   |
| EN 17                    | 20754       | Community-Cost Concentration Agreement on a concerted action project in the field of analysis of organic micro- pollutants in water.  |
| EN 18                    | 14017       | Exchange of letters constituting an agreement concerning the free passage of salmon in Vanern Lake.   |
| EN 21                    | 19699       | Memorandum of understanding on cooperation in earth sciences and environmental studies.   |

|       |       |  |
|-------|-------|--|
| EN 23 | 17308 | Agreement for plant protection-- Sudan quelea bird research project.   |
| EN 28 | 6989  | Agreement concerning co-operation in the matter of plant protection.   |
| EN 36 | 17973 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement concerning land use and soil conservation in the eastern Amazon region.                                  |
| EN 37 | 9963  | Agreement on plant protection and phytosanitary quarantine.  |
| EN 45 | 10476 | African Migratory Locust Convention.   |
| EN 6  | 23031 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement on the project Soil management and conservation in East Amazonia.  |
| FN 1  | 21671 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation on the Lake Volta Transport System.  |
| FN 10 | 5851  | Agreement relating to the purchase by Poland of surplus property prior to January 1, 1948.   |
| FN 11 | 25393 | Convention for the avoidance of double taxation and the prevention of fiscal evasion with respect to taxes on income.                                |
| FN 14 | 2913  | Agreement concerning the disposition of certain accounts in Thailand under Article 16 of the Treaty of Peace with Japan of 8 September 1951.         |
| FN 15 | 14491 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement concerning the delivery of a linear accelerator to the Cancer Institute.                                 |
| FN 17 | 24332 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.   |
| FN 22 | 22444 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.   |
| FN 24 | 20214 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.   |
| FN 28 | 4114  | Agreement for financing certain educational exchange programs.   |
| FN 3  | 10576 | Convention for the avoidance of double taxation and the prevention of fiscal evasion with respect to taxes on income.                                |
| FN 32 | 21732 | Agreement Concerning Financial co-operation.   |
| FN 35 | 8851  | Agreement concerning the collection of bills, drafts, etc.   |
| FN 37 | 11868 | Agreement concerning the compensation of Netherlands interests.  |
| FN 38 | 18930 | Convention for the avoidance of double taxation and the prevention of fiscal evasion with respect to taxes on income and on capital (with protocol). |
| FN 4  | 2526  | Convention for the avoidance of double taxation and the prevention of fiscal evasion with respect to taxes on income.                                |
| FN 6  | 22976 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.   |
| FN 8  | 25472 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.   |
| FN 9  | 10955 | Agreement for the avoidance of double taxation and the prevention of fiscal evasion with respect to taxes on income and capital gains.               |
| HR 13 | 132   | Fran-Belgian Agreement on passenger traffic.   |
| HR 15 | 15410 | Convention on the prevention and punishment of crimes against internationally protected persons, including diplomatic agents.                        |
| HR 17 | 21833 | Agreement on the fundamental rights of nationals.  |
| HR 25 | 2647  | Convention (with Final Protocol) concerning the reciprocal grant of assistance to distressed persons.  |
| HR 46 | 20762 | Convention of establishment.   |
| HR 7  | 10823 | Convention on the non-applicability of statutory limitations to war crimes and crimes against humanity.  |
| IN 16 | 6621  | Exchange of letters constituting an agreement relating to investment guaranties.   |
| IN 2  | 14366 | Agreement concerning financial assistance  |

|                |       |   |
|----------------|-------|---|
| MO 11          | 22962 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.  |
| MO 2           | 3172  | Agreement between Thailand and Japan concerning settlement of Special Yen Problem   |
| MO 21          | 21731 | Agreement concerning financial co-operation.  |
| SE 1           | 16035 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to military assistance: Eligibility requirements pursuant to the Foreign Assistance Act of 1973 and the International Security Assistance and Arms Export Control Act of 1976. |
| SE 10          | 2384  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to mutual security.  |
| SE 17          | 16034 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to military assistance: Eligibility requirements pursuant to the International Security Assistance and Arms Export Control Act of 1976.  |
| SE 28          | 2382  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to mutual security.  |
| SE 29          | 21950 | Exchange of letters constituting an agreement on a defense security arrangement.  |
| SE 3           | 2799  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to assurances under the Mutual Security Act of 1951.   |
| SE 31          | 2361  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to mutual security.  |
| SE 40          | 16314 | US and Kuwait: Technical Security Arrangement concerning special security measures.   |
| SE 5           | 2359  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to mutual security.  |
| SE 6           | 17310 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to military assistance: eligibility requirements pursuant to the International Security Assistance and Arms Export Control Act of 1976.  |
| SE 7           | 2356  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to mutual security.  |
| SE 8           | 20783 | Co-operation Agreement on civil defense and security.   |
| <i>average</i> |       |   |
| AC 29          | 9770  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement concerning trade in cotton textiles (with annex).   |
| AC 42          | 20684 | Agreement concerning economic, scientific and technical co-operation in the field of sugar production and sugar by-products (with additional note).   |
| AC 57          | 6389  | Agreement with respect to quality wheat.  |
| AC 58          | 7450  | Exchange of notes (with annex) constituting an agreement regarding the changes which the Government of the United Kingdom propose to introduce in their production and trade policies relating to cereals.                          |
| EN 11          | 20644 | Agreement on co-operation in the field of environmental protection.   |
| EN 15          | 15109 | Agreement on co-operation in the field of environmental protection (with agreed minutes).   |
| EN 19          | 20181 | Agreement for the protection of migratory birds and birds in danger of extinction and their environment.  |
| EN 20          | 4714  | International Convention (with annexes) for the Prevention of Pollution of the Sea by Oil.  |
| EN 24          | 11210 | European Agreement on the restriction of the use of certain detergents in washing and cleaning products.  |
| EN 34          | 22693 | Agreement for cooperation relating to the marine environment.   |
| EN 35          | 13920 | Agreement on co-operation in the field of environmental protection.   |
| EN 39          | 13823 | Agreement concerning the protection of the Sound Oresund from pollution.  |
| EN 48          | 485   | Convention on Nature Protection and Wild Life Preservation in the Western Hemisphere.   |
| EN 49          | 14097 | International Convention on Civil Liability for Oil Pollution Damage.   |
| EN 50          | 9587  | International Convention for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas (with Final Act and Resolution adopted by the Conference of Plenipotentiaries).   |

|       |       |  |
|-------|-------|--|
| EN 54 | 16710 | Convention on fishing and conservation of the living resources in the Baltic Sea and the Belts.  |
| EN 55 | 21623 | Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution.  |
| FN 7  | 81    | Reciprocal Trade Agreement.  |
| HR -2 | 1021  | Convention on the prevention and punishment of the crime of genocide.  |
| HR 16 | 4648  | Convention (No. 105) concerning the abolition of forced labor.   |
| HR 18 | 13928 | Protocol relating to refugee seamen.   |
| HR 23 | 7238  | Convention (No. 118) concerning equality of treatment of nationals and non-nationals in social security  |
| HR 33 | 283   | Constitution of the International Refugee Organization and Agreement on interim measures to be taken in respect of refugees and displaced persons.                                       |
| HR 9  | 14691 | OAU Convention governing the specific aspects of refugee problems in Africa.   |
| IN 1  | 22810 | Agreement for the promotion and protection of investments.   |
| IN 11 | 19570 | Convention concerning the mutual promotion and protection of investments.  |
| IN 12 | 24681 | Treaty on the encouragement and reciprocal protection of investments of capital  |
| IN 14 | 4922  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to the guaranty of private investments.   |
| IN 18 | 17730 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to Canadian investments in Western Samoa insured by the Government of Canada through its agent, the Export Development Corporation. |
| IN 21 | 19536 | Agreement for the promotion and protection of investments.   |
| IN 22 | 22733 | Agreement on the mutual protection of investments (with exchange of notes).  |
| IN 23 | 13396 | Convention on the protection of investments  |
| IN 25 | 5596  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to the guaranty of private investments.   |
| IN 26 | 15181 | Agreement for the promotion and protection of investments.   |
| IN 27 | 11642 | Exchange of letters constituting an agreement concerning the guarantees of investment securities.  |
| IN 29 | 24657 | Agreement on reciprocal promotion and protection of investments.   |
| IN 3  | 24875 | Foreign Investment Insurance Agreement.  |
| IN 31 | 8901  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to investment guaranties.   |
| IN 32 | 9855  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to investment guaranties.   |
| IN 33 | 20625 | Agreement on the mutual promotion and guarantee of investments.  |
| IN 34 | 24323 | Agreement on the mutual promotion and protection of investments (with exchange of letters)   |
| IN 37 | 7558  | Convention concerning the encouragement of capital investment and the protection of property   |
| IN 38 | 24235 | Agreement on processing and protection of investments (with exchanges of letters)  |
| IN 39 | 24956 | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to Canadian investments in the Kingdom of Thailand (with related letters).  |
| IN 40 | 23607 | Agreement concerning the encouragement and reciprocal protection of investments.   |
| IN 44 | 1837  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to guarantees authorized by Section 111 (b) (3) of the Economic Cooperation Act of 1948, as amended.                                |
| IN 8  | 24700 | Agreement for the promotion and protection of investments  |
| MO 1  | 9800  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement concerning the Guarantee by the Government of the United Kingdom and the maintenance of the Minimum Sterling                                 |

|                           |       |   |
|---------------------------|-------|---|
|                           |       | Proportion by the Government of Iceland.  |
| MO 12                     | 9374  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement regarding the guarantee by the Government of the United Kingdom and the maintenance of the minimum sterling proportion by Ireland.                              |
| MO 14                     | 24    | Exchange of Notes and Monetary Agreement.   |
| MO 16                     | 367   | Monetary Agreement.   |
| MO 6                      | 9806  | Exchange of letters constituting an agreement concerning the Guarantee by the Government of the United Kingdom and the maintenance of the Minimum of Sterling Proportion by the Government of Sierra Leone. |
| MO 8                      | 9815  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement concerning the Guarantee by the Government of the United Kingdom and the maintenance of the Minimum Sterling Proportion by the Government of Libya.             |
| SE 20                     | 1736  | The Security Treaty.  |
| SE 24                     | 2365  | Exchange of notes constituting an agreement relating to mutual security.  |
| SE 41                     | 324   | Inter-American Treaty of Reciprocal Assistance and Final Act of the Inter-American Conference for the Maintenance of Continental Peace and Security.  |
| SE 42                     | 14951 | Security Agreement concerning certain exchanges of secret information.  |
| <i>relatively complex</i> |       |   |
| AC 12                     | 12951 | International Sugar Agreement, 1973 (with annexes).   |
| DS 1                      | 14860 | Convention on the prohibition of the development, production and stockpiling of bacteriological (biological) and toxin weapons and on their destruction.  |
| DS 10                     | 9068  | Treaty for the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons in Latin America (with annexed Additional Protocols I and II).  |
| DS 3                      | 22495 | Convention on prohibitions or restrictions on the use of certain conventional weapons which may be deemed to be excessively injurious or to have indiscriminate effects.                                    |
| DS 5                      | 13678 | Treaty on the prohibition of the emplacement of nuclear weapons and other weapons of mass destruction on the sea-bed and the ocean floor and in the subsoil thereof.  |
| DS 7                      | 13445 | Interim Agreement on certain measures with respect to the limitation of strategic offensive arms.   |
| DS 8                      | 17119 | Convention on the prohibition of military or any other hostile use of environmental modification techniques.  |
| DS 9                      | 23002 | Agreement governing the activities of states on the moon and other celestial bodies.  |
| EN 25                     | 8164  | Convention on Fishing and Conservation of the Living Resources of the High Seas.  |
| HR -1                     | 37266 | Convention for the protection of human rights and dignity of the human being with regard to the application of biology and medicine: convention on human rights and biomedicine                             |
| HR -4                     | 22345 | Convention (No. 155) concerning occupational safety and health and the working environment.   |
| HR 10                     | 2889  | Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.   |
| HR 11                     | 20378 | Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.   |
| HR 20                     | 881   | Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War.  |
| HR 21                     | 5181  | Convention (No. 111) concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation.   |
| HR 22                     | 14861 | International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid.   |
| HR 27                     | 602   | Convention (No. 19) concerning equality of treatment for national and foreign workers as regards workmen's compensation for accidents.  |
| HR 28                     | 1341  | Convention (No. 98) concerning the application of the principles of the right to organize and to bargain collectively.  |

|       |       |   |
|-------|-------|---|
| HR 34 | 17955 | American Convention on Human Rights Pact of San Jose, Costa Rica.   |
| HR 43 | 17426 | Convention (No. 143) concerning migrations in abusive conditions and the promotion of equality of opportunity and treatment of migrant workers. |
| HR 8  | 14668 | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.   |
| IN 17 | 21071 | The Second ACP-EEC Convention (with protocols, final act and minutes of the Convention).  |
| SE 14 | 1835  | Security Treaty.  |